

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: August 26, 2014

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 5:00 p.m.

Members present: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members Absent:

**I. AGENDA**

1. Approval of the minutes of the June ARC Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes with corrections

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Rick Fifield

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

Approval of the minutes of the July ARC Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes with corrections.

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Rick Fifield

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 924 Lizardi St:

Application: Construct a one-story, 1285 sf single-family residence on an existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the current proposal was much improved and had responded well to the previous comments. However, they did make the following recommendations:

- Simplify the door from six to four panels.
- Simplify the transom to one or two lites.
- Simplify the gable window with trim similar to the other windows.
- Shutter and hand rails should be detailed as per HDLC details that will be provided.
- Extend the front gable further onto the hip over the front porch as per traditional hip-on-gable detailing.

Rick Fifield made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 2618 St Thomas Street

Application: Construct camelback, single-family, residence on an existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed the drawings provided could not be reviewed because they did not include the previously requested revisions or the required context drawing. Rick Fifield made a motion to defer further review of the project until the following recommendations are graphically incorporated into the drawings and a context drawing is provided:

- The overhang on the front of the building needs to be 3'-0" deep.
- Increase the floor to ceiling height. A 12'-0" ceiling height is typical of the neighborhood.
- The spacing of the windows on the side elevations is awkward and needs further study. One of the three windows at the rear of the right (4th St.) side elevation should be eliminated and the windows should be spaced to allow for the potential future installation of shutters or paired. The size of the windows on the front elevation may need to be adjusted or the location of the windows shifted to similarly allow for potential future shutters.
- The roof pitch should be increased to 7:12 or 8:12.
- An 8'-0" door with a 16" transom should be added to the front elevation.
- The window and door on the front elevation should be centered on their respective bays.
- The front chainwall should be stuccoed.
- Paneled shutters may be added.
- The siting of the building should be reviewed with zoning and the status of any existing variances confirmed. The air rights may need to be leased for the front overhang and steps that extend over the front property line.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

The ARC then took up item 20 out of order

20. 4900 Dauphine Street

Application: Retention of 289 sf accessory building constructed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Recommend retention with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

The ARC then returned to the regular agenda.

4. 3101 St Thomas Street

Application: Construct two-story, single-family residence on an existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed the drawings provided could not be reviewed because they did not include the previously requested revisions or the required context drawing (see enclosed example). Rick Fifield made a motion to defer further review of the project until the following recommendations are graphically incorporated into the drawings and a context drawing is provided:

- The front wall of the dormer needs to align with the front wall of the building. The dormer as drawn is too narrow and the details need further study. (refer to enclosed example)
- The roof pitch should not exceed 8:12.
- The full height of the front elevation should be expressed; the ceiling over the porch is unnecessarily furred down.
- The ceiling height should be a minimum of 10'-0".
- The bays should be evenly spaced and approximately 8'-0". A five-bay configuration should be studied.
- The drive-way should be located to the interior of the block, preferably to the rear (Chippewa St. side) of the building.
- Additional windows should be added to the side elevations.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 2511 Laurel Street

Application: Demolish existing building and construct two-story, single-family residence.

Motion: The ARC agreed the revisions are appropriate and Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- The landing of the front steps should better relate to the detailing of the water table/skirt board.
- The wood guardrail detail on sheet A3 needs further study. The newel posts at the wall at the balcony should be eliminated. The use of wood at the second floor balcony and metal at the first floor steps is appropriate.
- The stepped fascia detail at the balcony should be revised and the stepping eliminated.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 1016 Delarone Street

Application: Construct three-story, single-family residence with detached garage on an existing vacant lot.

Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommended that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- A rectangular window should be added to the front gable.
- The window sills on the front elevation should extend to the floor or be raised to the same height as the windows on the first floor at the side elevations.
- The size of the columns and the handrail at the front porch should be reduced and/or arranged to maximize the occupiable depth of the porch.
- The front steps should be widened to the full width of the column bay such that the handrails terminate at the face of the column.
- There should be a continuous chainwall at the front and sides of the front porch.
- The seam spacing of the standing seam roof should be 12".
- The proposed solar panel array should be consolidated, preferably on the upper roof.

By: Wayne Troyer

Seconded: Rick Fifield

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 5701 Dauphine St:

Application: Construct single family residence

Motion: Rick Fifield made a motion to defer the matter and the ARC made the following recommendations:

- Verify with a licensed engineer that this building does indeed need to be constructed on pilings. This type of building can generally be built on masonry piers.
- Raise the ceiling height to 11 or 12 feet to improve the proportions of the building.
- Modify the plan to allow the porch to extend across the entire front elevation.
- Detail the exterior of the building more like the adjacent bungalow. It is currently detailed more like a suburban residential building that is not appropriate for the historic district. The Staff can assist you with this detailing.
- Include a context elevation drawing of the proposed building to scale with a simple elevation of existing buildings on the block.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 923 Terpsichore Street

Application Construct two-family residence on an existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the revisions show a positive response to previous comments. The elevations work well and the U-shaped floor plan is interesting. However, they did make the following recommendations:

- The windows should be narrower which will create a better vertical proportion.
- The proposed garage door is too tall. It should read more as a carriage way. This could be better accomplished with the addition of a transom above the door.
- Modify the front entry steps to include side buttresses and metal handrails.

John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out with the Staff.

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 933 Terpsichore Street

Application: Construct two-story, 2490 sf, two-family residence on an existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the revised proposal responded well to the previous recommendations. However, the fascia at the eave-line should be deeper and incorporate a molding below the gutter. You should study similar historic buildings of this style on Erato and Annunciation Streets for examples of this condition. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 2612 St Thomas Street

Application: Construct two-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- American center hall cottages are typically Greek Revival or Italianate in style, and the architecture details should be modified to reflect one of these styles. The columns should be 8"x10" box columns, the beam at the front porch should be deeper and more built-up, and there should be an entablature above the front porch. Alternately, traditionally detailed dormers may be added in lieu of the entablature.
- The roof pitch should be increased to 7:12.
- The windows at the second floor on the side elevations should be moved slightly toward the ridge and away from the rafter edges.
- The full-height windows on the front elevation should be 6/9 or 2/4, but may still be double-hung.
- The overhangs at the front and rear edges of the roof should be eliminated.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: Rick Fifield

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 1758-1760 N Rampart St, 1034-1040 St Anthony Street

Application: General renovation of existing building, including modification of window and door openings and dormer addition.

Motion: Rick Fifield made a motion to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal, with the exception of the dormer, with the recommendation that a window be added at the second floor of the front facade of the addition.

The ARC clarified that by making recommendations regarding the proposed dormer, they are not indicating whether a dormer will be approved by the National Park Service as part of the tax credit application nor that approval for a dormer by HDLC will necessarily make it more likely NPS will approve a dormer. Three members of the ARC voted to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations, provided the revised design returns to ARC for review prior to being forwarded to the Staff; one member of the ARC abstained from voting:

- The size and profile of the dormer should be narrower and lower. The egress requirements for the proposed renovation should be reviewed, as it is possible the building may need to be sprinklered and therefore egress through the dormer is not required. This would allow the size of the window opening to be reduced. The window should read as a thin slot with a maximum height of 20". The pitch of the roof should also be minimized.
- The dormer should be clad entirely in metal to clearly distinguish it as a new intervention. Stucco is not appropriate at the sides of the dormer. Standing seam metal roofing will also allow the pitch of the roof to be reduced.
- The 6" wing wall at the sides of the dormer should be eliminated.
- A section of the dormer needs to be provided. The dormer should be studied in three-dimensions prior to returning to ARC; views from street level should be included.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: ?

Opposed:

Comments:

#### 12.2320 Constance Street

Application: Addition of 15'-0" towards the front of the house on existing camelback structure.

Motion: Due to the lack of drawings and representation, the ARC did not review the project.

#### 13.1911 Magazine Street

Application: Renovation of commercial building, including updated ADA access.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the detailing of the proposed wall enclosing the courtyard, including the articulated "pilasters" at corners and around gates, should be simplified to better reflect the architecture of the existing building. The exterior fireplace should also be simplified. The transparent sections of the fence should be decreased to smaller "punched" openings infilled with wrought iron fencing. The curved tops of the proposed gates should be eliminated. However, the ARC agreed there should be some change in height of the fence at this location, perhaps with a lintel. They did agree that the ornamentation of the ironwork could be reflective of motifs found in the existing architecture.

The ADA ramp should incorporate a parapet wall in lieu of the metal handrail proposed.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 3119 N. Rampart Street

Application: Addition to single-family residence.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the eave height of the addition should be lowered to match that of the main portion of the existing building. The addition should be sheathed in clapboard siding as opposed to the drop-lap siding. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommends conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: John Klingman

Result:

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

15. 3607 Magazine Street

Application: Install new restaurant vent hood, accessible lift, and construct 212 sf, one-story side addition at Designated Landmark.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommended that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal provided the section of railing that is removed at the front porch is salvaged and stored on site.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 2527 Rousseau Street

Application: Construct one-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: Rick Fifield made a motion to recommended that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- The projecting eave with exposed rafter detail should continue at all edges of the roof. A detail will need to be provided showing how eave vents will be incorporated if a ridge vent is installed.
- There should be a continuous chainwall at the foremost front facade and below the front porch. The chainwall should return one bay at the sides.
- The light pattern of the windows should be characteristic of the Craftsman style. The ARC suggested 6/2 or 6/1.
- A window should be added on the right (2nd St.) elevation at the Master Bedroom.
- The front door detailing needs further study.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 156 Pelican Avenue

Application: Construct 416 sf porch at rear of house.

Motion: Rick Fifield made a motion to recommended that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- A door should be installed in one of the existing window openings.
- A beam should be installed above the columns, such that the porch ceiling is recessed.
- There should be four (4) columns.

- The drawings need to be accurately drawn to scale. A 16'-0" deep porch with adequate head height will have a much lower roof pitch and this need to be represented in the drawings. A lower roof pitch and standing seam metal roofing are appropriate.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

#### 18. 1829 Magazine Street

Application: Addition of new 200 sf steel gallery with 42" cast iron guardrails to match adjacent gallery.

Motion: Rick Fifield made a motion to recommend conceptual approval provided verification of existing subsurface utility and drainage conditions is submitted.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

#### 19. 813 Poland Avenue

Application: This item was withdrawn.

#### 21. 1107 St. Anthony Street

Application: Construct 2,377 sf, two-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: Rick Fifield made a motion to recommended that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations:

- Option 'B' with a door and a raised sill window is preferred; however, the window adjacent to the garage door should be eliminated and the light patterns for the door and windows from Option 'A' should be used.
- The doors should be 8'-0" tall with a transom above. The header of the window at the first floor should be adjusted accordingly. The header of the garage does not need to align with the header of the door and windows.
- The angled supports below the balcony should be eliminated.
- The roof should cantilever over the balcony and extend with a single pitch.
- The windows on the right (N. Rampart St.) side should be moved away from the corners of the building enough to allow for the potential future installation of shutters.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:



22. 917 N. Villere Street

Application: General renovation, including construction of balcony on front facade and reconstruction of two-story service wing.

Motion: At that time the ARC made the following recommendations:

- Maintain the appearance of two distinct buildings by lowering the parapet wall of the connecting element below the eaveline of the main building. A low cricket behind the parapet will be adequate to accommodate necessary drainage requirements.
- Install posts below the gallery in line with the posts shown above in lieu of newel posts. Contact the Staff for appropriate detailing.

Rick Fifield Made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

23. 937 Bartholomew Street

Application: Two-story rear addition to existing one-story residence.

Motion: At that time the ARC made the following recommendations:

- Do not modify the front elevation. The existing door and window should remain.
- The wide two-story addition proposed is not appropriate. However, a single story addition with that footprint is approvable with a smaller, second story camelback that is the width of the original two bay shotgun. There should be two windows on the front elevation of the camelback.
- Construct a small covered entry porch at the new side entrance facing the drive.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

24. 1020 Race Street

Application: Construct two-story rear porch for required egress.

Motion: Rick Fifield made a motion to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Rick Fifield

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

24. 701-705 1St Street

Application: Construct two-story rear porch for required egress.

Motion:

The ARC disagreed whether the introduction of strong circular shapes with no existing basis of design to support the motif is appropriate. Furthermore, in the absence of historical evidence specifically dating the construction of the polygonal window in the gable end facing 1st Street, it should not be assumed the window is not historic. The ARC agreed the polygonal window should be retained, but agreed that the introduction of a circular window at the stairwell on the right (Soraparu St.) side of the building is still appropriate.

Taking this in consideration, the ARC agreed squared opening at the gable end on Annunciation St. should be retained. The ARC agreed extending the existing roof line over the balconette is appropriate and an improvement over the current canopy condition, but should extend the width of the opening and may be extended and tapered to provide even more coverage to the balconette below. The ARC agreed the balconette could be widened slightly, but that the turned balustrade guardrail is inappropriate. The ARC suggested a simple parapet wall instead.

John Klingman made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Rick Fifield, John Klingman, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments: Wayne Troyer recused himself from the discussion.

#### 26. Discussion on ARC policy for galleries.

The ARC agreed that gallery posts should be located at the edges of galleries and spaced at regular intervals. They agree to recommend against the installation of a gallery if these criteria cannot be met.

At this time, there was no further business to discuss, and the meeting was adjourned.